Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics and Society (SPPS)

ISSN 1614-3515

General Editor: Andreas Umland.

Institute for Euro-Atlantic Cooperation, Kyiv, umland@stanfordalumni.org

Commissioning Editor: Max Jakob Horstmann, London, mih@ibidem.eu

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE*

DOMESTIC & COMPARATIVE POLITICS

Prof. Ellen Bos, Andrássy University of Budapest

Dr. Gergana Dimova, University of Winchester

Dr. Andrey Kazantsev, MGIMO (U) MID RF, Moscow

Dr. Mykhailo Minakov, Kennan Institute, Washington

Prof. Heiko Pleines, University of Bremen

Prof. Richard Sakwa, University of Kent at Canterbury

Dr. Sarah Whitmore, Oxford Brookes University

Dr. Harald Wydra, University of Cambridge

SOCIETY, CLASS & ETHNICITY

Col. David Glantz, "Journal of Slavic Military Studies"

Dr. Marlène Laruelle, George Washington University

Dr. Stephen Shulman, Southern Illinois University

Prof. Stefan Troebst, University of Leipzig

POLITICAL ECONOMY & PUBLIC POLICY

Dr. Andreas Goldthau, Central European University

Dr. Robert Kravchuk, University of North Carolina

Dr. David Lane, University of Cambridge

Dr. Carol Leonard, Higher School of Economics, Moscow

Dr. Maria Popova, McGill University, Montreal

ADVISORY BOARD*

Prof. Dominique Arel, University of Ottawa

Prof. Jörg Baberowski, Humboldt University of Berlin

Prof. Margarita Balmaceda, Seton Hall University

Dr. John Barber, University of Cambridge

Prof. Timm Beichelt, European University Viadrina

Dr. Katrin Boeckh, University of Munich

Prof. em. Archie Brown, University of Oxford

Dr. Vyacheslav Bryukhovetsky, Kyiv-Mohyla Academy

Prof. Timothy Colton, Harvard University, Cambridge

Prof. Paul D'Anieri, University of Florida

Dr. Heike Dörrenbächer, Friedrich Naumann Foundation

Dr. John Dunlop, Hoover Institution, Stanford, California

Dr. Sabine Fischer, SWP, Berlin

Dr. Geir Flikke, NUPI, Oslo

Prof. David Galbreath, University of Aberdeen

Prof. Alexander Galkin, Russian Academy of Sciences

Prof. Frank Golczewski, University of Hamburg

Dr. Nikolas Gvosdev, Naval War College, Newport, RI

Prof. Mark von Hagen, Arizona State University

Dr. Guido Hausmann, University of Munich

Prof. Dale Herspring, Kansas State University

Dr. Stefani Hoffman, Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Prof. Mikhail Ilyin, MGIMO (U) MID RF, Moscow

Prof. Vladimir Kantor, Higher School of Economics

Dr. Ivan Katchanovski, University of Ottawa

Prof. em. Andrzej Korbonski, University of California

Dr. Iris Kempe, "Caucasus Analytical Digest"

Prof. Herbert Küpper, Institut für Ostrecht Regensburg

Dr. Rainer Lindner, CEEER, Berlin

Dr. Vladimir Malakhov, Russian Academy of Sciences

FOREIGN POLICY & INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS

Dr. Peter Duncan, University College London

Prof. Andreas Heinemann-Grüder, University of Bonn

Prof. Gerhard Mangott, University of Innsbruck

Dr. Diana Schmidt-Pfister, University of Konstanz

Dr. Lisbeth Tarlow, Harvard University, Cambridge

Dr. Christian Wipperfürth, N-Ost Network, Berlin

Dr. William Zimmerman, University of Michigan

HISTORY, CULTURE & THOUGHT

Dr. Catherine Andrevey, University of Oxford

Prof. Mark Bassin, Södertörn University

Prof. Karsten Brüggemann, Tallinn University

Dr. Alexander Etkind, University of Cambridge

Dr. Gasan Gusejnov, Moscow State University

Prof. Georgii Kasianov, NASU, Kyiv

Prof. Leonid Luks, Catholic University of Eichstaett

Dr. Olga Malinova, Russian Academy of Sciences

Dr. Richard Mole, University College London

Prof. Andrei Rogatchevski, University of Tromsø

Dr. Mark Tauger, West Virginia University

Dr. Luke March, University of Edinburgh Prof. Michael McFaul, Stanford University, Palo Alto

Prof. Birgit Menzel, University of Mainz-Germersheim Prof. Valery Mikhailenko, The Urals State University

Prof. Emil Pain, Higher School of Economics, Moscow Dr. **Oleg Podvintsev**, Russian Academy of Sciences

Prof. **Olga Popova**, St. Petersburg State University

Dr. Alex Pravda, University of Oxford

Dr. Erik van Ree, University of Amsterdam

Dr. Joachim Rogall, Robert Bosch Foundation Stuttgart

Prof. Peter Rutland, Wesleyan University, Middletown

Prof. Marat Salikov, The Urals State Law Academy

Dr. Gwendolyn Sasse, University of Oxford

Prof. Jutta Scherrer, EHESS, Paris

Prof. Robert Service, University of Oxford

Mr. James Sherr, RIIA Chatham House London

Dr. Oxana Shevel, Tufts University, Medford

Prof. Eberhard Schneider, University of Siegen

Prof. Olexander Shnyrkov, Shevchenko University, Kyiv Prof. Hans-Henning Schröder, SWP, Berlin

Prof. Yuri Shapoval, Ukrainian Academy of Sciences

Prof. Viktor Shnirelman, Russian Academy of Sciences

Dr. Lisa Sundstrom, University of British Columbia

Dr. Philip Walters, "Religion, State and Society", Oxford

Prof. Zenon Wasyliw, Ithaca College, New York State

Dr. Lucan Way, University of Toronto

Dr. Markus Wehner, "Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung"

Dr. Andrew Wilson, University College London

Prof. Jan Zielonka, University of Oxford

Prof. Andrei Zorin, University of Oxford

^{*} While the Editorial Committee and Advisory Board support the General Editor in the choice and improvement of manuscripts for publication, responsibility for remaining errors and misinterpretations in the series' volumes lies with the books' authors.

Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics and Society (SPPS)

ISSN 1614-3515

Founded in 2004 and refereed since 2007, SPPS makes available affordable English-, German-, and Russian-language studies on the history of the countries of the former Soviet bloc from the late Tsarist period to today. It publishes between 5 and 20 volumes per year and focuses on issues in transitions to and from democracy such as economic crisis, identity formation, civil society development, and constitutional reform in CEE and the NIS. SPPS also aims to highlight so far understudied themes in East European studies such as right-wing radicalism, religious life, higher education, or human rights protection. The authors and titles of all previously published volumes are listed at the end of this book. For a full description of the series and reviews of its books, see www.ibidem-verlag.de/red/spps.

Editorial correspondence & manuscripts should be sent to: Dr. Andreas Umland, Institute for Euro-Atlantic Cooperation, vul. Volodymyrska 42, off. 21, UA-01030 Kyiv, Ukraine

Business correspondence & review copy requests should be sent to: *ibidem* Press, Leuschnerstr. 40, 30457 Hannover, Germany; tel.: +49 511 2622200; fax: +49 511 2622201; spps@ibidem.eu.

Authors, reviewers, referees, and editors for (as well as all other persons sympathetic to) SPPS are invited to join its networks at www.facebook.com/group.php?gid=52638198614 www.linkedin.com/groups?about=&gid=103012 www.xing.com/net/spps-ibidem-verlag/

Recent Volumes

- 207 Per A. Rudling Tarnished Heroes The Organization of Ukrainian Nationalists in the Memory Politics of Post-Soviet Ukraine ISBN 978-3-8382-0999-9
- 208 Kaja Gadowska, Peter Solomon (Eds.) Legal Change in Post-Communist States Progress, Reversions, Explanations ISBN 978-3-8382-1312-5
- 209 Pawel Kowal, Georges Mink, Iwona Reichardt (Eds.)
 Three Revolutions: Mobilization and Change in Contemporary Ukraine I
 Theoretical Aspects and Analyses on Religion, Memory, and Identity
 ISBN 978-3-8382-1321-7
- 210 Pawel Kowal, Georges Mink, Iwona Reichardt (Eds.)
 Three Revolutions: Mobilization and Change in Contemporary Ukraine II
 An Oral History of the Revolution on Granite, Orange Revolution, and Revolution of Dignity ISBN 978-3-8382-1323-1
- 211 Li Bennich-Björkman; Sergiy Kurbatov (Eds.) When the Future Came The Collapse of the USSR and the Emergence of National Memory in Post-Soviet History Textbooks ISBN 978-3-8382-1335-4
- 212 Olga R. Gulina Migration as a (Geo-)Political Challenge in the Post-Soviet Space Border Regimes, Policy Choices, Visa Agendas With a foreword by Nils Muižnieks ISBN 978-3-8382-1338-5
- 213 Sanna Turoma, Kaarina Aitamurto, Slobodanka Vladiv-Glover (Eds.)
 Religion, Expression, and Patriotism in Russia Essays on Post-Soviet Society and the State ISBN 978-3-8382-1346-0
- 214 Vasif Huseynov
 Geopolitical Rivalries in the
 "Common Neighborhood"
 Russia's Conflict with the West, Soft Power, and
 Neoclassical Realism
 With a foreword by Nicholas Ross Smith
 ISBN 978-3-8382-1277-7

Mikhail Suslov

GEOPOLITICAL IMAGINATION

Ideology and Utopia in Post-Soviet Russia

With a foreword by Mark Bassin



Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über http://dnb.d-nb.de abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de.

Cover illustration: Paysage IX by Anton Semakin. Printed with kind permission.

ISBN-13: 978-3-8382-1361-3 © *ibidem*-Verlag, Stuttgart 2020 Alle Rechte vorbehalten

Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen des Urheberrechtsgesetzes ist ohne Zustimmung des Verlages unzulässig und strafbar. Dies gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen und elektronische Speicherformen sowie die Einspeicherung und Verarbeitung in elektronischen Systemen.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means (electronical, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the prior written permission of the publisher. Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

Printed in the EU

Contents

Foreword by Mark Bassin	9
List of Figures	13
List of Tables	15
Acknowledgements	17
Introduction	19
Studying Russian geopolitical imagination	19
Renaissance of geopolitics	27
Conspiracy, dialogue and political participation	33
Part I	
Geopolitical Culture: Approaches to Understanding	39
Chapter 1	
The Logic of Recognition, Confrontation and Exceptionali Russian Geopolitical Culture	sm in
Russia's "perpetual geopolitics"	41
Struggle for recognition and Russian geopolitical	
imagination	
"Large space" and isolationism	
The stigma of barbarism	62
Geopolitical Messianisms	67
Conclusions	76
Chapter 2	
Creating Usable Spaces in Education: Textbooks on Geopo	
Introduction	79
Geopolitics Redux: Studying, Teaching, Selling	81
Geopolitics: Ideology or pragmatism?	87
"Laws of geopolitics"	91
Securitization in textbooks	94

	Biopolitics and the rhetoric of "energy"	97
	Spatialization of history and the anti-colonial rhetoric	.103
	Conclusions	.108
Cha	apter 3	
	vilizationism" in Russian Geopolitical Culture	
	Introduction	.111
	The mainstream political debates, "sovereign democracy" and the ideology of "Edinaia Rossiia"	.119
	ROC and civilizational discourses	
	The logic of fragility and security in civilizational discourses	
	Conclusions	
	apter 4 opolitical Imagination and Russian Imperial Science Fiction Introduction	.145
	The Big Other of post-Soviet SF	.151
	Geopolitics of civilizations	.156
	The imperial sublime in Russian SF	.160
	Biology and energy	.164
	Engaging with Strugatsky brothers	.167
	Orthodox SF	.174
	Conclusions	.178
Par Ima	t II aginary Places	. 181
	apter 5 oly Russia"	
	Introduction	.183
	"Holy Russia" project	.184
	"Holy Russia" as a civilization	.190
	Mapping Kirill's pastoral visits	.198

Chapter 6	
Continent Eurasia in Russian Geopolitical Imagination	
Introduction	203
Defining Eurasian continentalism	206
"Naturalness"	209
Hyperbole of development	214
Hyperbole of autonomy	220
Hyperbole of authenticity	223
Conclusions	226
Chapter 7	
Eurasian Symphony: Geopolitical Imagination and Alternative History	
Introduction	227
Emplotment and enjoyment in alternative history	229
Irony in Eurasian Symphony	233
East and West in Eurasian Symphony	237
Conclusions	244
Chapter 8	
"Novorossiia" in Russian Geopolitical Culture	
Introduction	247
Methodological note: The brand "Novorossiia" and its	
ideological meaning	250
Where is Novorossiia? Territorial indeterminacy	254
Ideology of Novorossiia	262
Novorossiia in online debates	268
Conclusions	274
Afterword: Amendments to the Constitution and	
Geopolitical Visions, 2020	277
Index	287

Foreword

The term "geopolitics" – the subject of Mikhail Suslov's highly original collection of essays – has become remarkably popular since the end of the Cold War. It might therefore be useful to introduce his work by considering more generally where this popularity comes from. Perhaps the most basic source of the appeal of geopolitics is the fact that there is no fixed and universally-accepted definition of exactly what it is supposed to mean or represent. Very much to the contrary, across the century or so since the term made its entrance into public political discourses, it has consistently been used in ways that not only differ quite substantially but indeed not infrequently are simply mutually incompatible. Paradoxically, this pronounced protean character is not a drawback but rather a key to geopolitics' broad appeal, for it enables the term to appear relevant and useful in a wide variety of different contexts and applications. Suslov's work does not escape these ambiguities; to the contrary it actively incorporates them-at least implicitly-at its very core. Thus, while the *subject* of his examinations involves one particular conceptualization of geopolitics, the analytical method he uses in order to examine this subject is "geopolitical" in an entirely different sense. The considerable skill that he deploys in navigating the undulations between these two alternatives is one of the features that make these essays so fascinating and insightful.

Suslov's subject is a geopolitics understood as the study of how the objective material conditions of the external world influence the character of political and national life. This perspective dates back to the origins of classical geopolitics as a positivistic and causal "science" that revealed how geographical features and conditions—physical size, location, topography, climate, maritime access, and so on—function as geopolitical "realities" to shape the political character and destinies of states and nations. The intense imperial and post-imperial competition of the Great Powers from the

¹ Klaus Dodds and David Atkinson (eds.), Geopolitical Traditions: A Century of Geopolitical Thought (London: Routledge, 2000).

10

end of the 19th century through the first half of the 20th saw the flourishing of national schools of geopolitics in Britain, the USA, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, and (to a lesser extent) Imperial Russia.2 The USSR, however, was a notable exception. In the form of Marxism-Leninism, the Soviet authorities opted for a very different set of causal explanations for the imperatives driving national politics, and they consistently resisted the principle of environmental determination inherent in geopolitics. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, however, geopolitika began to take hold in post-Soviet Russia, and it was precisely the reductionist insistence on the salience of environmental-geopolitical "realities" in explaining the twisted contours of Russia's national predicament that made it appealing. In another deep paradox, despite all the traditional Soviet castigation, the rigid causality and putative objectivity of geopolitics resonated on some subliminal level with the crude positivism of Soviet-Marxist materialism itself, and this made geopolitics seem an attractive candidate when the time came to replace the latter.

The proliferation of neo-classical geopolitics in Russia has been much facilitated by the activities and writings of Aleksandr Dugin, an extremist on the Russian far right who at an early point appreciated the potential appeal of a perspective emphasizing the primacy of geographical factors for understanding and managing Russia's national affairs. A thoroughly mediocre intellectual but a highly effective ideologue, Dugin carefully armed himself with a knowledge of Western geopolitical theory, readjusted it to fit the post-Soviet context of the 1990s, and emerged as an effective publicist – most notably as the author of a a highly popular and successful textbook The Foundation of Geopolitics.3 By the beginning of Vladimir Putin's reign in the early 2000s, geopolitika had proven its appeal to a variety of constituencies in Russia: universities, the military, and perhaps most significantly of all to the ruling elite, which quickly came to appreciate the effectiveness of pointing to objective geopolitical realities and imperatives as the basis for its various

² Geoffrey Parker, Western Geopolitical Thought in the 20th Century (London: Croom Helm, 1985).

³ Aleksandr Dugin, Osnovy geopolitiki. Geopoliticheskoe budushchee Rossii. Myslit' prostranstvom, 2nd ed. (Moscow: Arktogeia-tsentr, 2000).

political projects. As Suslov discusses, geopolitics has been and remains one of the great growth industries in Putin's Russia. Regardless of his origins on the extremist fringe and the enduring extremism of his politics, Aleksandr Dugin has today become Russia's chief geopolitician and an entirely mainstream figure.

If Suslov's *subject* is to be understood in terms of the mindsets of classical and neo-classical geopolitics, however, our author's own epistemological and analytical position comes from a much more recent geopolitical tradition. This is so-called "critical geopolitics," more specifically that part of critical geopolitics focused on the problem of geographical representation, or what Suslov calls in his title "geopolitical imagination".4 Taking its initial inspiration from the precepts of post-modernism, this perspective begins by rejecting the assumption of an objective and external geographical world that shapes and conditions political life. To the contrary, critical geopolitics teaches that geography is always "constructed" in precisely the same way that history or identity are constructed. A geopolitical reality is therefore nothing of the sort, it is rather a phantom, a representation that makes a claim to objectivity and veracity in order to fortify narratives and interpretations that are in fact politically biased and interest-driven.

Critical geopolitics scrutinizes the arguments of classical or neo-classical geopolitics with a two-fold purpose: first, to reveal the subjective character of geopolitical narratives that claim to be dealing with genuine objective realities, and second to deconstruct them to reveal the underlying political intentions, projects, biases and prejudices that they support and reflect. The great inspiration for this endeavour was Edward Said's seminal deconstruction of Western narratives of "the Orient," which continues to inspire critical-geopolitical analyses of the contemporary policies of the traditional Western powers toward the rest of the world.⁵

As exemplified in the essays collected here, Mikhail Suslov's intervention into the field of critical geopolitics is distinguished by

⁴ Gearoid Ó'Tuathail and Simon Dalby (eds.), *Rethinking Geopolitics* (London: Routledge, 1998).

⁵ Edward Said, Orientalism (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1978).

a significant nuance — one that might be illustrated by a comparison to Said's own analysis. Said emphasized that the authors of the Orientalist discourse on which he focuses – historians, ethnographers, poets, and artists-did not necessarily recognize the biased and constructed nature of the deeper perspectives they were representing, and so did not necessarily appreciate the hegemonic calculations of political power that underlay them. In other words, Orientalist discourse was not necessarily created with the express purpose of serving as an ideological vehicle for the political project of dominating the Orient. Suslov takes a very different approach. The common thread that runs through all of his analyses of post-Soviet society, whether focused on narratives devised by the political elite or on the work of academic "geopoliticians", is precisely that of intentionality. Whether the theme is "Eurasianism," "Holy Rus," "the Russian World," or something else, Suslov at all times is not only interrogating the narrative itself but beyond this is questioning who are its agents, what is the relevant political context, and what is the transactional goal that they are seeking to achieve? In the final analysis, what Suslov is offering is a different sort of critical geopolitics, one in which the geopolitical narratives and perceptions in question are understood not merely as expressions of social and political attitudes. Beyond this – and often more importantly – they represent practical ideological devices and strategies that are consciously developed and deployed as part of an effort to further a particular political objective or project.

As noted at the outset, geopolitics is a wide-ranging concept with a kaleidoscope of different meanings and associations. In this collection of essays, Mikhail Suslov offers us his own take on the subject: a brilliant exploration of how geographical images and visions work to shape our understanding, organization and signification of the political world.

Mark Bassin Stockholm, August 2020