

General Editor: Andreas Umland, *Shevchenko University of Kyiv*, umland@stanfordalumni.org

Editorial Assistant: Olena Sivuda, *Dragomanov Pedagogical University of Kyiv*, sivuda@ukrcognita.com.ua

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE*

DOMESTIC & COMPARATIVE POLITICS

Prof. **Ellen Bos**, *Andrássy University of Budapest*
Dr. **Ingmar Bredies**, *Kyiv-Mohyla Academy*
Dr. **Andrey Kazantsev**, *MGIMO (U) MID RF, Moscow*
Dr. **Heiko Pleines**, *University of Bremen*
Prof. **Richard Sakwa**, *University of Kent at Canterbury*
Dr. **Sarah Whitmore**, *Oxford Brookes University*
Dr. **Harald Wydra**, *University of Cambridge*

SOCIETY, CLASS & ETHNICITY

Col. **David Glantz**, *“Journal of Slavic Military Studies”*
Dr. **Rashid Kaplanov**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Dr. **Marlène Laruelle**, *EHESS, Paris*
Dr. **Stephen Shulman**, *Southern Illinois University*
Prof. **Stefan Troebst**, *University of Leipzig*

POLITICAL ECONOMY & PUBLIC POLICY

Prof. em. **Marshall Goldman**, *Wellesley College, Mass.*
Dr. **Andreas Goldthau**, *Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik*
Dr. **Robert Kravchuk**, *University of North Carolina*
Dr. **David Lane**, *University of Cambridge*
Dr. **Carol Leonard**, *University of Oxford*

ADVISORY BOARD*

Prof. **Dominique Arel**, *University of Ottawa*
Prof. **Jörg Baberowski**, *Humboldt University of Berlin*
Prof. **Margarita Balmaceda**, *Seton Hall University*
Dr. **John Barber**, *University of Cambridge*
Prof. **Timm Beichelt**, *European University Viadrina*
Prof. **Archie Brown**, *University of Oxford*
Dr. **Vyacheslav Bryukhovetsky**, *Kyiv-Mohyla Academy*
Prof. **Timothy Colton**, *Harvard University, Cambridge*
Prof. **Paul D’Anieri**, *University of Kansas, Lawrence*
Dr. **Heike Dörrenbächer**, *DGO, Berlin*
Dr. **John Dunlop**, *Hoover Institution, Stanford, California*
Dr. **Sabine Fischer**, *EU Institute for Security Studies*
Dr. **Geir Flikke**, *NUPI, Oslo*
Prof. **Alexander Galkin**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Prof. **Frank Golczewski**, *University of Hamburg*
Dr. **Nikolas Gvosdev**, *“The National Interest,” DC*
Prof. **Mark von Hagen**, *Arizona State University*
Dr. **Guido Hausmann**, *Trinity College Dublin*
Prof. **Dale Herspring**, *Kansas State University*
Dr. **Stefani Hoffman**, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem*
Prof. **Mikhail Ilyin**, *MGIMO (U) MID RF, Moscow*
Prof. **Vladimir Kantor**, *Higher School of Economics*
Dr. **Ivan Katchanovski**, *University of Toronto*
Prof. em. **Andrzej Korbonowski**, *University of California*
Dr. **Iris Kempe**, *Center for Applied Policy Research*
Prof. **Herbert Küpper**, *Institut für Ostrecht München*
Dr. **Rainer Lindner**, *Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik*
Dr. **Vladimir Malakhov**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Dr. **Luke March**, *University of Edinburgh*

FOREIGN POLICY & INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS

Dr. **Peter Duncan**, *University College London*
Dr. **Taras Kuzio**, *George Washington University, DC*
Prof. **Gerhard Mangott**, *University of Innsbruck*
Dr. **Diana Schmidt**, *University of Bremen*
Dr. **Lisbeth Tarlow**, *Harvard University, Cambridge*
Dr. **Christian Wipperfürth**, *N-Ost Network, Berlin*
Dr. **William Zimmerman**, *University of Michigan*

HISTORY, CULTURE & THOUGHT

Dr. **Catherine Andreyev**, *University of Oxford*
Prof. **Mark Bassin**, *University of Birmingham*
Dr. **Alexander Etkind**, *University of Cambridge*
Dr. **Gasán Gusejnov**, *University of Bremen*
Prof. em. **Walter Laqueur**, *Georgetown University*
Prof. **Leonid Luks**, *Catholic University of Eichstaett*
Dr. **Olga Malinova**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Dr. **Andrei Rogatchevski**, *University of Glasgow*
Dr. **Mark Tauger**, *West Virginia University*
Dr. **Stefan Wiederkehr**, *DHI, Warsaw*

Dr. **Michael McFaul**, *Stanford University, California*
Prof. **Birgit Menzel**, *University of Mainz-Germersheim*
Prof. **Valery Mikhailenko**, *The Urals State University*
Prof. **Emil Pain**, *Higher School of Economics, Moscow*
Dr. **Oleg Podvintsev**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Prof. **Olga Popova**, *St. Petersburg State University*
Dr. **Alex Pravda**, *University of Oxford*
Dr. **Erik van Ree**, *University of Amsterdam*
Dr. **Joachim Rogall**, *Robert Bosch Foundation, Stuttgart*
Prof. **Peter Rutland**, *Wesleyan University, Middletown*
Dr. **Sergei Ryabov**, *Kyiv-Mohyla Academy*
Prof. **Marat Salikov**, *The Urals State Law Academy*
Dr. **Gwendolyn Sasse**, *University of Oxford*
Prof. **Jutta Scherrer**, *EHESS, Paris*
Prof. **Robert Service**, *University of Oxford*
Mr. **James Sherr**, *Defence Academy of the UK, Swindon*
Dr. **Oxana Shevel**, *Tufts University, Medford*
Prof. **Eberhard Schneider**, *University of Siegen*
Prof. **Olexander Shnyrkov**, *Shevchenko University, Kyiv*
Prof. **Hans-Henning Schröder**, *University of Bremen*
Prof. **Viktor Shnirelman**, *Russian Academy of Sciences*
Dr. **Lisa Sundstrom**, *University of British Columbia*
Dr. **Philip Walters**, *“Religion, State and Society,” Leeds*
Prof. **Zenon Wasyliv**, *Ithaca College, New York State*
Dr. **Lucan Way**, *University of Toronto*
Dr. **Markus Wehner**, *“Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung”*
Dr. **Andrew Wilson**, *University College London*
Prof. **Jan Zielonka**, *University of Oxford*
Prof. **Andrei Zorin**, *University of Oxford*

* While the Editorial Committee and Advisory Board support the General Editor in the choice and improvement of manuscripts for publication, responsibility for remaining errors and misinterpretations in the series' volumes lies with the books' authors.

Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics and Society (SPPS)

ISSN 1614-3515

Founded in 2004 and refereed since 2007, SPPS makes available affordable English-, German- and Russian-language studies on the history of the countries of the former Soviet bloc from the late Tsarist period to today. It publishes approximately 20 volumes per year, and focuses on issues in transitions to and from democracy such as economic crisis, identity formation, civil society development, and constitutional reform in CEE and the NIS. SPPS also aims to highlight so far understudied themes in East European studies such as right-wing radicalism, religious life, higher education, or human rights protection. The authors and titles of previously published and forthcoming manuscripts are listed at the end of this book. For a full description of the series and reviews of its books, see <http://www.ibidem-verlag.de/red/spps>.

Note for authors (as of 2007): After successful review, fully formatted and carefully edited electronic master copies of up to 250 pages will be published as b/w A5 paperbacks and marketed in Germany (e.g. vlb.de, buchkatalog.de, amazon.de). English-language books will, in addition, be marketed internationally (e.g. amazon.com). For longer books, formatting/editorial assistance, different binding, oversize maps, coloured illustrations and other special arrangements, authors' fees between €100 and €1500 apply. Publication of German doctoral dissertations follows a separate procedure. Authors are asked to provide a high-quality electronic picture on the object of their study for the book's front-cover. Younger authors may add a foreword from an established scholar. Monograph authors and collected volume editors receive two free as well as further copies for a reduced authors' price, and will be asked to contribute to marketing their book as well as finding reviewers and review journals for them. These conditions are subject to yearly review, and to be modified, in the future. Further details at www.ibidem-verlag.de/red/spps-authors.

Editorial correspondence & manuscripts should, until 2008, be sent to: Dr. Andreas Umland, DAAD, German Embassy, vul. Bohdana Khmel'nitskoho 25, UA-01901 Kiev, Ukraine; umland@stanfordalumni.org.

Business correspondence & review copy requests should be sent to: *ibidem*-Verlag, Julius-Leber-Weg 11, D-30457 Hannover, Germany; tel.: +49(0)511-2622200; fax: +49(0)511-2622201; spps@ibidem-verlag.de.

Book orders & payments should be made via the publisher's electronic book shop at: http://www.ibidem-verlag.de/red/SPPS_EN/

Recent Volumes

- 63 *Paul D'Anieri and Taras Kuzio (Eds.)*
Aspects of the Orange Revolution I
Democratization and Elections in Post-Communist Ukraine
ISBN 978-3-89821-698-2
- 64 *Bohdan Harasymiw*
in collaboration with Oleh S. Ilnytskyj (Eds.)
Aspects of the Orange Revolution II
Information and Manipulation Strategies in the 2004 Ukrainian Presidential Elections
ISBN 978-3-89821-699-9
- 65 *Ingmar Bredies, Andreas Umland and Valentin Yakushik (Eds.)*
Aspects of the Orange Revolution III
The Context and Dynamics of the 2004 Ukrainian Presidential Elections
ISBN 978-3-89821-803-0
- 66 *Ingmar Bredies, Andreas Umland and Valentin Yakushik (Eds.)*
Aspects of the Orange Revolution IV
Foreign Assistance and Civic Action in the 2004 Ukrainian Presidential Elections
ISBN 978-3-89821-808-5
- 67 *Ingmar Bredies, Andreas Umland and Valentin Yakushik (Eds.)*
Aspects of the Orange Revolution V
Institutional Observation Reports on the 2004 Ukrainian Presidential Elections
ISBN 978-3-89821-809-2
- 68 *Taras Kuzio (Ed.)*
Aspects of the Orange Revolution VI
Post-Communist Democratic Revolutions in Comparative Perspective
ISBN 978-3-89821-820-7
- 69 *Tim Bohse*
Autoritarismus statt Selbstverwaltung
Die Transformation der kommunalen Politik in der Stadt Kaliningrad 1990-2005
Mit einem Geleitwort von Stefan Troebst
ISBN 978-3-89821-782-8
- 70 *David Rupp*
Die Rußländische Föderation und die russischsprachige Minderheit in Lettland
Eine Fallstudie zur Anwaltspolitik Moskaus gegenüber den russophonen Minderheiten im „Nahen Ausland“ von 1991 bis 2002
Mit einem Vorwort von Helmut Wagner
ISBN 978-3-89821-778-1

Taras Kuzio

**THEORETICAL AND COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES
ON NATIONALISM**

New Directions in Cross-Cultural and Post-Communist Studies

With a foreword by Paul Robert Magocsi

ibidem-Verlag
Stuttgart

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Technical Assistance: Olena Sivuda.

Frontcover pictures:

- (1) Viktor Yushchenko kissing Ukrainian flag held by Ukrainian soldiers during his inauguration as President of Ukraine, 23 January 2005.
- (2) Ukrainian multiculturalism: Front cover of the weekly popular magazine *Fokus* (Kyiv) devoted to immigrants living permanently in Ukraine.
- (3) Ukrainian nationalist cartoon drawn during on-going sharp debates over Russian attitudes to the Ukrainian language and Ukrainian sovereignty.

Reprint permission:

The chapters of this book are reprints of articles which have previously appeared in:

- (1) *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol.25, no.1 (January 2002), pp.20-39.
- (2) *Nations and Nationalism*, vol.7, no.2 (April 2001), pp.135-154.
- (3) *Journal of Contemporary European Politics*, vol.13, no.2 (August 2005), pp.217-232.
- (4) *Politics*, vol.21, no.3 (September 2001), pp.169-178.
- (5) *Contemporary Politics*, vol.6, no.2 (June 2000), pp.143-164.
- (6) *East European Perspectives*, vol.4, nos.15 and 16 (24 July and 7 August 2002).
- (7) Wsevolod W. Isajiw ed., *Society in Transition. Social Change in Ukraine in Western Perspectives* (Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 2003), pp.21-52. Translated in *Ukrayinske Suspilstvo Na Shliakhu Peretvoren: Zakhidna Interpretatsiya* (Kyiv: KM Akademiya, 2004), pp.45-70.
- (8) *East European Perspectives*, vol.5, nos.13, 14, 15 (25 June, 9 and 23 July 2003).
- (9) *Journal of Political Ideologies*, vol.7, no.2 (June 2002), pp.133-162.
- (10) *Ethnicities*, vol.1, no.3 (December 2001), pp.343-366.
- (11) *Canadian Review of Studies in Nationalism*, vol.32, nos.1-2 (December 2005), pp.17-29.
- (12) *National Identities*, vol.3, no.2 (July 2001), pp.109-132.
- (13) *Nationalities Papers*, vol.30, no.2 (June 2002), pp.241-264.
- (14) *Nationalities Papers*, vol.33, no.1 (March 2005), pp.30-58.
- (15) *Nationalities Papers*, vol.34, no.3 (September 2006), pp.407-427.

These journals' publishers' kind permission to reproduce these papers here is gratefully acknowledged.

∞

Gedruckt auf alterungsbeständigem, säurefreiem Papier
Printed on acid-free paper

ISSN: 1614-3515

ISBN-10: 3-89821-815-5

ISBN-13: 978-3-89821-815-3

© *ibidem*-Verlag
Stuttgart 2007

Alle Rechte vorbehalten

Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen des Urheberrechtsgesetzes ist ohne Zustimmung des Verlages unzulässig und strafbar. Dies gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen und elektronische Speicherformen sowie die Einspeicherung und Verarbeitung in elektronischen Systemen.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means (electronical, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the prior written permission of the publisher. Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

Printed in Germany

CONTENTS

Foreword by Paul Robert Magocsi 7

INTRODUCTION 9

I COMPARATIVE and THEORETICAL NATIONALISM

1 The Myth of the Civic State: A Critical Survey of Hans Kohn's Framework for Understanding Nationalism 13

2 'Nationalising States' or Nation Building: A Review of the Theoretical Literature and Empirical Evidence 36

3 Can Western Multiculturalism Be Applied to the Post-Soviet States: A Critical Response to Kymlicka 60

II NATIONALISM and TRANSITOLOGY

4 Transition in Post-Communist States: Triple or Quadruple? 83

5 The National Factor in Ukraine's Quadruple Transition 96

6 National Identity and Democratic Transition in Post-Soviet Ukraine and Belarus: A Theoretical and Comparative Perspective 126

7 Ukraine's Post-Soviet Transition: A Theoretical and Comparative Perspective 151

III COUNTRY CASE STUDIES OF NATIONALISM

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 8 | Russians and Russophones in the Former USSR and Serbs in Yugoslavia: A Comparative Study of Passivity and Mobilisation | 177 |
| 9 | Nationalism in Ukraine. Towards a New Theoretical and Comparative Framework | 217 |
| 10 | Identity and Nation-Building in Ukraine: Defining the ‘Other’ | 253 |
| 11 | Rusyns in Ukraine: Between Fact and Fiction | 279 |

IV HISTORY, MYTHS and NATIONALISM

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 12 | History and National Identity among the Eastern Slavs: Towards a New Framework | 301 |
| 13 | History, Memory and Nation Building in the Post-Soviet Colonial Space | 335 |
| 14 | Nation-State Building and the Re-Writing of History in Ukraine: The Legacy of Kyiv Rus | 364 |
| 15 | National Identity and History Writing in Ukraine | 399 |

About the Author 424

Foreword

Ukraine is the second largest country in Europe and a major economic force on that continent and beyond. It is, therefore, not surprising that when the country finally achieved independent statehood in 1991, it became the subject of attention among a wide range of government policy makers, scholars, and the media. The international spotlight once again focused on Ukraine during the hectic and inspiring days of the Orange Revolution in late 2004, this time as a test case for the survival of democratic values in post-communist Europe.

Interest in Ukraine has resulted in the appearance of an ever-increasing number of books, articles, and media reports, in particular about contemporary developments in the country. So much has appeared in print that it is well nigh impossible to keep up with the burgeoning mass of data. There is one person, however, who seems to be able to remain on top of the information explosion. That person is Dr. Taras Kuzio, who remains today one of the best informed individuals on current developments in Ukraine.

Taras Kuzio is not, however, a news junkie; he is a scholar and informed analyst. Trained as a political scientist, he has a solid knowledge of history and comparative political systems, which he uses to make sense of the myriad and conflicting data about Ukraine that is all too readily available in print and the electronic media.

The essays in this book reflect Dr. Kuzio's ability to provide intellectual depth and context to contemporary developments in Ukraine, and in Europe and North America. He is rightly concerned with the phenomenon of nationalism, so denigrated in western intellectual circles in the decades immediately following World War II until its "re-discovery" and resurrection as a legitimate subject of inquiry following the Revolutions of 1989 and the disintegration of the Soviet Union.

In the pages that follow the reader will encounter essays that discuss the various theoretical approaches to the phenomenon of nationalism, the manner in which the nationalist factor has played out in post-Communist Ukraine and neighboring states, and finally the use or misuse of history in the creation of myths to help legitimize new states in central and eastern Europe.

Dr. Kuzio has established for himself a reputation as someone who is not afraid to speak his mind and who is not limited by the kind of self-censorship that often characterizes the statements of government officials or academic colleagues ensconced in respectable institutions. Reading Dr. Kuzio can be intellectually stimulating, at times disconcerting, and frequently provocative. In many ways, the fifteen essays in this book might be considered “the best of Kuzio.”

Paul Robert Magocsi
Toronto, October 2007

INTRODUCTION

This volume brings together 15 articles that have earlier appeared in scholarly journals and in books that were written and published over the last decade. The book is divided into four sections covering different theoretical and comparative perspectives on nationalism.

The first section includes three articles that provide alternative perspectives on the theoretical and comparative aspects of nationalism by engaging with leading nationalism scholars Hans Kohn, Rogers Brubaker and Will Kymlicka. The myth of the civic state investigates how North American and European liberal democracies are incorrectly assumed to be devoid of all ethno-cultural influences and civic nationalism. All states, including liberal democracies, are built on ethno-cultural core or cores that influence their political culture, national identities, historical myths and language policies. Immigrant countries, such as the U.S., Canada and Australia, are no different as they were built on Anglo-Saxon, Anglo-French or British core identities that in the case of anglophone (but not francophone) Canada have relatively recently become multi-cultural. The second article takes issue with Brubaker's division of European states into 'civic' and 'nationalising' states. The dichotomy builds on Kohn's division of Europe into good civic and bad ethnic states. Using Brubaker's theoretical framework, Western civic states can also be defined as having been nationalisers in their past history. In some cases, as in assimilationist France, they remain nationalisers. The division is therefore artificial as it refers to the fact that the West and East undertook the same policies but in different time periods. The enlargement of the EU and NATO into central-eastern Europe has transformed nationality policies in post-communist Europe on a far more rapid scale than the long process of nationalization over many centuries in the West. The final article in the first section engages Kymlicka, Canada's pre-eminent scholar of multiculturalism, over the applicability of Western concepts of multiculturalism to Ukraine and other post-communist states. The article discusses a range of concepts that Kymlicka has eloquently articulated in a large number of publications and argues that the conditions found in Ukraine and other post-communist states, particularly in the former USSR, do not provide fertile

ground for the introduction of multicultural policies that are suitable for a mature democracy and long established state, such as Canada.

The second section includes four studies that deal with an aspect of what has come to be known as ‘transitology’ that has largely ignored the question of the nation. Scholars came to eventually understand that post-communist transition, particularly in the former USSR, was fundamentally different to transitions in Latin America and southern Europe in the 1970s. In these transitions, the state and nation had long been established and the change mainly focused on transition from authoritarianism to democracy. In most of these fascist or authoritarian states a market economy or semi-market economy was also in place. In some post-communist and most post-Soviet states the transition was what I describe in the first article in this section as ‘quadruple’ with the next three articles developing this scholarly investigation in greater depth and clarity. A quadruple transition incorporates democratic and market economic reforms, the building of an independent state and new institutions and the forging of an integrated nation. Transition was inevitably therefore more complicated in states undergoing quadruple transitions (especially when quadruple transition states in the CIS do not have an offer of EU membership, unlike central-eastern Europe). One article in this section compares and contrasts the role of nationalism in Ukraine and Belarus that shows how civic nationalism can play a positive role in democratic transitions while Soviet nationalism (as in Belarus), or ethnic nationalism, plays a destructive role. Nationalism therefore is not intrinsically bad for democratic transitions; it depends on which type of nationalism is in place: civic, ethnic, Soviet or great-power imperial.

The third section applies nationalism theory to country case studies. A central question discussed in the first article investigates why Russophone and Serb diaspora’s reacted in different ways to the disintegration of empires. The disintegration of the USSR and Yugoslavia stranded large numbers of ethnic Russians and Serbs outside their newly independent states. But, only in the Serbian case did they mobilize and attempt to unite into a greater Serbia. Russian diaspora’s remained placid and inter-ethnic conflicts that erupted did not largely affect the Russian diaspora’s in the former USSR even in states, such as Estonia and Latvia, where they were denied citizenship. The article argues that Serbs and Russians reacted in different ways because of their histories, Serbs had an independent nation-state while Russians were always an imperial people, and because of different ethnic Serb and imperial-statist Russian nationalisms. Other articles in this section investigate nationalism in Ukraine and

provide an alternative framework and typology for understanding different strands of nationalism that exist. The article challenges traditional ways of defining nationalism in Ukraine as purely that associated with western Ukraine and argues that there are varied types of nationalism that range across the political spectrum. The final article engages with Paul Robert Magocsi on the question of the Rusyns in Ukraine who are either defined as a Ukrainian regional group or as a fourth eastern Slavic nation. The article compares and contrasts the different identities found in Trans-Carpathia with those found in other border regions in Europe and finds that conflicting and competing identities in such localities are quite common. Although many scholars have accepted *ipso facto* that a Rusyn revival is taking place in Trans-Carpathia (i.e. Ukrainians are re-defining themselves as Rusyn) the article concludes that such claims are not based on hard sociological data, surveys, census results or political science studies.

The fourth and final section investigates the inter-relationship between history, myths, national identity and nationalism. The first article debates with Western historians of Russia and the USSR as to the framework used in surveying Russian and Soviet history. Most Western historians continue to use traditional imperial historiography in surveying Russian history that conflates Belarus and Ukraine within 'Russia' as an eastern Slavic history stretching from Kyiv Rus to the twentieth century. Traditional Western histories are histories of geographical entities, not dynasties, and a history of 'Russia' today should therefore focus on the territory within the Russian Federation. The remaining three articles compare and contrast the use of history in nation-building projects in post-colonial states, such as in the former USSR, and in Ukraine when history is re-taken from the former imperial ruler and re-presented as the exclusive domain of the newly independent state. The last two articles investigate how Ukrainian historiography has re-evaluated the origins of the Ukrainian state, especially Kyiv Rus, away from an overall 'Russian' (i.e. eastern Slavic) history to that which is the exclusive property of Ukraine.